Mozambique

Civil Society Participation and the Governance of Educational Systems in the Context of Sector-Wide Approaches to Basic Education

DRAFT
2006

Graduate Student Researcher:
Carly (Caroline) Manion

cmanion@oise.utoronto.ca

Under the direction of:

Dr. Karen Mundy
Ontario Institute for Studies in Education
of the University of Toronto
kmundy@oise.utoronto.ca

Takala and Marope (2002) indicate that throughout the 90's around 40% of education expenditure came from external sources, whereas Buchert (2002) notes that in 2001 28% of education expenditure came from external sources, perhaps suggesting an improvement in the aid dependency situation of Mozambique.

Civil society activism is a recent phenomenon in Mozambique (CEF 2003). Pfeiffer (2004) notes that international NGOs and Pentecostal-influenced church movements are the main civil society groups active in the country. The majority of national and international NGOs are based in urban areas, with church-based groups dominating the civil society scene in rural areas. Pfeiffer (2004) argues that the international NGO presence has exacerbated social inequality by channeling resources primarily to local and national elites. Furthermore, the fact that church-based organizations are proliferating and thriving in poor communities throughout Mozambique, outside of the aid relationship, suggests a deepening of the marginalization experienced by vulnerable groups in the market economy.

Very few CSOs focus exclusively on education, with most favouring a multi-sectoral approach. In a NORAD study, Kruse (2002) suggests that the "traditional" roots and character of many CSOs renders them invisible to contemporary views of what a CSO is, or should "look like". The lack of cohesion amongst CSOs and the weak capacity of both the state and civil society present formidable challenges to the establishment of education partnerships between these two sets of actors, as well as with the donor community.

Very little information was found concerning teachers' unions vis-à-vis education governance in Mozambique. We do know there is the Organização Nacional de Professores (National Teachers' Organization, "ONP"). Regarding Mozambique's implementation of mother-tongue based bilingual primary education in parts of the rural countryside, Benson (2004) suggests that the "teachers' unions", as well as some communities caused resistance to this policy on the basis of the perception that it was "top-down" and non-consultative (59). However, Benson (2004) also notes that a "major NGO", with familiarity in Bantu languages in adult bilingual literacy has taken over the "support and monitoring work" in various classrooms in two provinces (60).

Civil society in Mozambique formally (yet not necessarily substantively) participates in education governance through Commonwealth Education Fund and Fast Track initiatives,

TABLE OF CONTENTS

List of Acronyms

ANCEFA	African Network Campaign on Education For All
CDF	Community Development Foundation
CEF	Commonwealth Education Fund
CS	Civil Society
CSO	Civil Society Organization
EFA	Education For All
ESSP	Education Sector Strategy Paper
FAWEMO	Forum for African Women Educationalists - Mozambique
FRELIMO	Liberation Front of Mozambique (Portuguese acronym)
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GER	Gross Enrollment Ratio
GNI	Gross National Income
GNP	Gross National Product
GOAM	Grupo Operativo para o Avanco da Mulher
GPA	General Peace Agreement
HDI	Human DevelopmGNPEducation For Allent

salient in the country – namely the northern, central and southern regions (Bertelsen 2003; Braathen 2003; Carbone 2003).

Following an intense and protracted (1964-1974) liberation struggle, Mozambique gained independence from Portugal in 1975. Established in Dar-es-Salaam, Tanzania in 1962, the Liberation Front of Mozambique (its Portuguese acronym being FRELIMO) assumed leadership of the newly independent country (Carbone 2005), and from 1977 to the signing of the General Peace Agr

periphery administrative structures" (Braathen 2003:5). The governance system inherited by Mozambique was a centralized one "in which the local government structures

perspectives concerning the extent to which the rebel guerrilla group Renamo was externally and internally supported; both perspectives include recognition of the extremely violent and brutal war tactics each side engaged in as well as the long-term negative socio-economic and political legacy of the horrendous war that left over one million people dead (Bertelsen 2003; Bornstein 2000; Hanlon 2004; Weinstein 2002).

One perspective emphasizes the role of external actors, including the U.S., the apartheid South African and the Rhodesian states, in supporting Renamo militarily and politically[3] in their violent efforts to destabilize the single-party regime, whose explicitly "Marxist-Leninist" agenda was a particularly salient issue in the regional and international geo-political context of the Cold War. In contrast to this perspective, a second view argues that Renamo enjoyed considerably more popular support in Mozambique than usually publicized (Weinstein 2002).

In 1983 and 1986 there were two donor strikes resulting in the food aid being withheld. However foreign aid increased from US$359 million in 1985 to US$ 875 million in 1988 as a consequence of the states' response to economic deterioration due to the war and falling world prices for primary agricultural products (the mainstay of the Mozambican economy), which involved the adoption of World Bank/IMF structural adjustment reforms. These reforms emphasized privatization and a transition to a market capitalism as the state "made its turn towards the west" (Hanlon 2004:749). However, as Hanlon notes the "learning about capitalism from donors… [involves the lesson that] capitalism is not about profit, but about patronage" (749). He provides the example of the process of business privatization in which "loans" are given that "need not be repaid according to who you know and donor whim" (Hanlon 2004:749).

1.2. Democratic Transition

As mentioned above, the first multi-party elections were held in 1994, with Frelimo winning the largest share of votes, and again doing so in the 1999 national elections. In the most recent presidential elections of December 2004, the incumbent Frelimo party was re-elected with Armando Emilio Guebuza seceding Joaquim Chissano as President.

---

[3] It is important to note that Frelimo, the governing party in the single-party state of Mozambique had offered a safe haven to African liberation army soldiers that were opposing the white regimes in South Africa and Rhodesia from the late 70's to mid-80's (Bertelsen 2003).

In recent years, the government has been experimenting with a system of decentralized development planning that devolves administrative and political authority from the central to the provincial and district levels of government (United Nations Capital Development Fund, accessed January 14, 2006). Specifically, the Municipal Law 2/1997 established the legal framework for democratic elections in urban and semi-urban area although not for rural areas (Alexander 1997). In response to donor community pressure to implement decentralized governance reforms, and state recognition that there was an urgent need to re-establish its administrative authority in heretofore marginalized rural areas, Decree 15/2000 was implemented that saw "traditional leaders" and "secretaries of suburban quarters or villages" formally recognized by the state as "community authorities" (Buur and Kyed 2005:5). The recognition of "traditional leaders" as "community authorities" is particularly salient given that these individuals (regulos, as they are referred to in Portuguese) were immediately banned by Frelimo in the post-independence era.

> While the donor community did not initially anticipate that the Decree would become the only piece of legislation to cater for some form of 'representative organ' in the rural areas, that was what it ended up being (Buur and Kyed 2005:12).

Furthermore since 2003, the implementation of "consultative forums" with representatives of "a variety of local stakeholders" have begun to be held across the country, and in particular in rural areas (Buur and Kyed 2005:12). These consultative forums have emerged out of the mass organizations of the party that had proliferated around the country, from urban barrios to rural villages as part

sub-district levels that had "operated hitherto on a *de facto* basis, without official recognition (Lars and Kyed 2005:15).

> The Decree 15/2000 and the LOLE law therefore provided the basis for legally institutionalizing the interaction (*articulação*) between local state organs and forms of civil society groups in

As the first African country to qualify for debt relief under the HIPC initiative and subsequently the Enhanced HIPC program, Mozambique currently has an external debt load of around $966 million (2002 est.) (CIA Fact Book). With an average annual GDP real growth rate of 7.7% (World Bank) the country's economic outlook is hopeful. The country received US$ 933 million in aid in 2001, US$ 2,054 million in 2002 and US$1,033 million in 2003 (OECD, accessed January 4, 2006). As a percentage of GNP, official development aid to Mozambique represented around 25 percent in 2003, down from 60% in 2002 (Ibid). The bilateral share of ODA flows into the country was around 66% in 2003, with 6% and 9% of total bilateral aid going the education and health sectors respectively in the 2002-2003 period (Ibid). During this same year, over 55% of total bilateral ODA went to debt servicing (Ibid). Major donor countries in Mozambique, and particularly in the education sector are Canada, the Netherlands, Finland, Denmark, Ireland and Sweden. The US is also a main donor country to Mozambique, particularly in the areas of governance and health.

Mozambique ranked 168 out of 177 countries in the UNDP 2005 Human Development Index (UNDP, 2005). In 2001 an estimated 70 percent of the population was below the poverty line (CIA Fact Book), with over 80 percent of the workforce employed in subsistence agriculture. The main sector is the "service", accounting for close to half of the GDP in 2003, with "industry" and "agricultural" sectors accounting for 32 percent and 21% respectively (CIA Fact Book). The main exports are cashews, sugar and cotton (Disney 2002).

In terms of development indicators, Mozambique had a average life expectancy of 40.7 years, an infant mortality rate of 101 (per 1,000 live births) and an under five mortality rate (per 1,000 children) of 147 in 2003 (World Bank, Mozambique Data Profile, accessed January 8, 2006) as of 2003 Mozambique had a national illiteracy rate of 53.6% (68% amongst female population) (World Bank, Mozambique-At-A-Glance), with an urban illiteracy rate of 36.7% (42% for urban women) and a rural illiteracy rate of 65.7% (81% for rural women) (Ibid).

1.4. The Corruption Curse and Implications for Civil Society

Perhaps unsurprising given the deep regional roots supporting a dense patronage network and the highly centralized nature of the Frelimo regime, even within a competitive,

democratic political system, the reality of high levels of state corruption remains a major development and political challenge facing Mozambique in the current era (Hanlon 2004). Hanlon (2004) argues that the donor community is willing to tolerate "quite blatant corruption if the elite rapidly puts into place 'market-friendly' policies changes" (748).

Corruption grew in Mozambique during the 1990's, within the context of rapid implementation of externally-driven (IFIs and donor community) liberalization reforms, particularly with respect to privatizing sectors and industries that had been nationalized/collectivized during the preceding socialist era (Disney 2002; Hanlon 2005; Weinstein 2002). Interestingly, as Hanlon (2004) suggests the rise in corruption over the past fifteen years stands in stark contrast to Mozambique as a "paragon of integrity" in the late 70's (747). It is argued that Frelimo elite were divided between a "major corrupt faction" and those who wanted to address high levels of state corruption (Hanlon 2004:747). In the end, Hanlon argues that donors decided to collaborate with the "corrupt faction" as they "told them what they wanted [to hear]", and also because the anti-corruption elite in the party were also quite critical of World Bank structural adjustment policies – something that the donor community was not disposed to align with! (748).

Braathen (2003) and others (Bertelsen, 2003; Posner, 2004), use either the term "patrimonial" or "repatrimonialism" to describe an important characteristic of the political regime in Mozambique. According the former, "repatrimonialism means that the patrimonial features of state and politics become more salient" (11). She proceeds to identify four features of "repatrimonialism" in Mozambique:

(i) political exclusion along vertical-territorial lines (in Mozambique exclusion of the rural population),
(ii) personalization (virtualization) of power,
(iii) businessification of politics, and
(iv) privatization (and patronagisation) of the state.

Provocatively, Hanlon (2004) suggests that in the last few years Mozambique has become a "criminalized state" (747), as the legal system has collapsed, with "court rulings available to the highest bidder (747), money laundering has become widespread and common, and several areas of the country have become "drug warehousing and transit centers", involving senior officials (Southern Institute of Security Studies, cited in

Hanlon 2004:747). In early 2001 and again later this same year respectively, Carlos Cardoso, a newspaper editor in Mozambique and Siba-Siba Macuanua a head of banking supervision were publicly assassinated. Both individuals were committed to investigating and exposing several bank fraud scandals, involving the reported loss of over US$40 million (Hanlon 2004). Investigations into these killings were blocked at the highest levels of the state and the fact that even when some individuals were imprisoned they were "allowed to escape", have prompted some (Hanlon 2004, Disney 2002) to speculate that senior Frelimo members were involved in large-scale bank frauds.

There is direct relevance of the rampant corruption that seems to be sweeping the Mozambican state and the activities of civil society in the country. Specifically I am referring to the role of civil society in appealing to the donor community to pressure government to address the problem of corruption in its ranks (Hanlon 2004). However, it is precisely because of the context of "deep and wide corruption in government, that civil society has less influence" (Hanlon 2004:753). Furthermore, Hanlon asserts that when it came to discussions around debt relief for Mozambique, USAID lobbied Nordic donor representatives in support of the claim that debt relief was more important than corruption. It is argued that the success of this lobbying is attributable to the need to maintain the "myth of the Mozambican success story" (Hanlon 2004:748; Weinstein 2002). Indeed, despite high levels of relatively undisguised corruption, at the donor Consultative Group meeting in 2001 (less than two months after Siba-Siba Macuanua was assassinated), Mozambique asked for US$600 million and received US$722 million (Hanlon 2004:748).

2. Education Policy Landscape

At independence Mozambique's education system was weak and elitist in nature. However some momentum in terms of improving and expanding educational opportunities, and particularly literacy training, was gained within the context of the national liberation struggle (1964-74), a context in which education and literacy were priorities (Disney 2002). The immediate post-independence era saw major political and social transformations, with the expansion and nationalization of educational opportunities a cornerstone of such transformations. This led to an "education boom"

(Negrao 2002) involving a massive expansion in primary enrollments within the first five years of independence. By 1981, gross primary enrollment stood at around 95% (Mario, Buendia, Kouwenhoven, Alberto and Waddington 2002:19)[4].

Educational development has been guided by the assumptions and strategies most commonly associated with the human capital development approach as well as the governments desire to consolidate control and maintain a centralized system of education delivery in Mozambique, specifically during single-party rule (Disney 2002). The first five years or so of education planning in Mozambique is significant because it was during this time that the question of education quality emerged and it was believed that good planning and strong control mechanisms were the key components to ensuring quality. Thus, as Mario et al., (2002) suggest, the emphasis on government control of the education planning process led to a considerable reduction in the participation of the population in education initiatives (19).

In 1982 a new national education system (Sistema Nacional de Educacao in Portuguese) (SNE being its English acronym) was established. While (Mario et al. 2002:6) indicate that the SNE creation had involved "public debate" (6), there are no further and/or specific details concerning the nature of such civil participation in this education policy process. The SNE focused on ensuring the constitutionally guaranteed right to education was protected. Within the SNE education was also viewed as an essential strategy for poverty reduction.

In 1983, as the civil war began to spread and intensify, the SNE was implemented and with it the policy of compulsory and universal 7 years of primary education as well. However, there was a mass migration out of rural areas as the civil war spread, with large numbers moving into urban areas, making it virtually impossible to develop an effective and efficient education system. By 1986, 45% of the schools in Mozambique, and particularly those in rural areas, had been destroyed in the war (Mario et al. 2002:3). In

---

4

1988, the primary gross enrollment rate had plummeted to 59%, from a high of 95% in 1981, with the net enrollment rate decreasing from 40% in 1981 to 32% in 1988 (MINED 1989, 15-19) (cited in Mario et al. 2002:6)

> This deepened the gap between demographic growth and the capacity of the school network and, consequently, led to the long-term postponement of the introduction of compulsory and universal education that was a fundamental objective of the education reform of 1983 (Mario et al. 2002:6).

In the MINED's 1989 report in which the SNE was assessed, the ministry concluded that there were several problems, beyond the challenges posed by the rapid increase in rural to urban migration and the destruction wrought by the war, that thwarted the efficiency of the SNE during its implementation phase. The excessive centralization and the poor management capacity of the education system were singled out in this report as barriers to the successful implementation of the SNE. In terms of pedagogical and logistical challenges to the efficiency of SNE associated reforms, MINED's report highlights the large number of untrained and/or poorly trained teachers working in the education system. Specifically, the key problem identified, was that the new primary school curriculum had yet to be incorporated into the teacher education programs in the country (Mario et al. 2002).

In 1990, at the Conference of Donors, the Ministry of Education (MINED) presented "Education in Mozambique: Problems and Perspectives" (Mario et al. 1999). This document greatly influenced the development future education policy frameworks.

Mozambique's participation at the Jomtien Education Conference in 1990 marked the beginning of the revitalization of education process in the country (Mario et al. 1999). Since 1994 the government has emphasized education as a fundamental human right and necessary for poverty reduction, social stability and national development.

> The government…defined as priority the development of

The 1995 National Education Policy and Strategies for Implementation document highlighted the importance of education for national development. Furthermore, education continued to be a priority area emphasized during the most recent (2004) presidential elections.

2.1.   Analysis of Education Sector Studies 1990-1998

indicated the need for more and better trained teachers, and for more care to be taken facilitate regional and gender parity in the distribution of teachers, especially in primary schools throughout the country (Mario et al. 2002:30). Due to reduced state spending in the education sector as part of macroeconomic "adjustment", and the accompanying decrease in administrative staff in the sector, as well as the geographic (among other forms) isolation of some communities, teachers often are under-supervised, not to mention "under-supported".

Fourth, with respect to learning/teaching materials, there was a common theme around the lack of distributional and production capacity of the system to meet demand. Furthermore, concern is expressed because "teaching materials are inadequate because they lack awareness of the multilingual environment of Mozambique" (Mario et al. 2002:31). Indeed there is quite a bit of literature debating the issue of bilingual education in Mozambique.

A further theme presented by Mario et al. (2002) concerns the need to respond to the evolution of the majority of enrollments in non-formal and adult education literacy and post-literacy courses, to the current situation where there has been a steady rise in enrollments in evening classes in primary and secondary education (31).

Finally, Mario et al., (2002) indicate that discussion and highlighting of the importance of community involvement in education emerges as a theme from their analysis of education sector documents in the 90's.

2.2. *The Education Sector Strategy Program(s)*

Beginning development in 1997 and implementation in 1999, the Education Sector Strategy Program(ESSP) 1999-2003 – "Reviving Schools and Expanding Opportunities"-the process around this education policy framework has been a collaborative one, involving donor, civil society and agencies/institutions working in the education sector in the country (World Bank 1999). However, as Mario et al. (2002) suggest the consultations with civil society were "considered by some as still insufficient" (8). The mandate of the ESSP is to provide,

> … increased and equitable access to higher quality education
> through improvement in the management of education in order
> to promote economic and social development in Mozambique
> (World Bank 1999:2).

The ESSP seeks to ensure the quality and relevancy of the education available. Thus, the ESSP "has as its priority the increase of access to educational opportunities at all levels of education, having as a primary target the rapid progression to universal primary education, particularly promoting the increase of the enrolment of girls", (MINED 1998:1). In summary the three main objectives of the ESSP are: i) increased educational access; ii) improved quality of education and iii) to ensure sustainability of educational improvement (i.e., expanded access and quality).

While not a World Bank initiative per se, IDA contributions to ESSP activities at the primary and secondary levels as well as strategic planning for other sub-sectors (i.e., technical and vocational education reforms, a project for which is currently in the World Bank pipeline), are a result of the approval and support of the World Bank for the ESSP. Furthermore, the ESSP complements the Bank's "Country Assistance Strategy" framework for Mozambique and specifically the Government's objectives of poverty reduction through:

(a) Promoting rapid, broad-based private sector led growth
(b) Capacity building and developing human resources
(c) Strengthening development partnerships (World Bank 1999:3).

In the current era, as education SWAp(s), the ESSP(s) 1999-2003 and the current one, 2004-2008, continue to guide the education reform process, the decentralization of MINED as well as the nature and destinations of donor (both bilateral and pooled) funding to the sector in Mozambique (Mundy & Bhanji 2005: World Bank 1999).

Since 2000, CIDA has been considered a major bilateral donor to Mozambique in the areas of education, agriculture/rural development, HIV/AIDS and governance (CIDA 2004). CIDA is currently supporting the ESSP with close to $29 million dollars in funding for the period 2003-2006. Future CIDA sector-wide support of the Mozambican government will be in the form of "pooled funds" and "some PBAs" (Mundy and Bhanji 2005:11), with other donors, as well as "support to decentralized projects that target the most vulnerable" (CIDA 2004:7). Support to the education sector in Mozambique will comprise half of the bilateral programming resources (CIDA 2005:9).

The specific areas of support for CIDA funding reflect the priorities of the Mozambican government as outlined in the PARPA. These priorities are improved educational quality, increased access to primary education and the strengthening of institutional capacity (CIDA 2004:10). Specifically CIDA's support is channeled to the following: i) the education sector pooled fund; ii) provision of educational materials, including textbooks; iii) literacy programming; iv) gender equality in education and v) HIV/AIDS prevention education programs in schools (CIDA 2004:10). Under the ESSP, CIDA has committed $20 million to support for education materials Phase I (2003-2005) (cited in Mundy and Bhanji 2005:11).

Under the ESSP, civil society seems to be given some responsibility for monitoring and evaluating progress in the education sector made through ESSP activities. Under the "Summary Program Analysis – Participatory Approach" section of the ESSP Project Appraisal Document (World Bank 1999), the following appears,

> The program is demand driven and based on the perception
> of the benefits of more and better quality education by
> Government and civil society (World Bank 1999:33).

In terms of the future prospects for ESSP impacts, Mario et al. (2002) suggest that the .

> …sustainability of the outcomes of the ESSP should be
> guaranteed, on the one hand, through the continued processes
> of inquiry and links with the society and, on the other hand,

2012, 17% of the teaching force will die due

We can see from the above statistics that there is a drastic decrease in both GER and NER at the secondary level! We also see a relatively high increase in the proportion of private enrollments at the secondary level compared to the primary level. This may be due to the very limited spaces available at the secondary level. However, low enrollment at this level may also reflect the non-compulsory nature of secondary education, and prevailing attitudes that education is not relevant to the needs of the majority rural population (Disney 2002; Ibraimo 2003).

2.4. Girls' Education

In terms of equality, rural girls are the most disadvantaged in terms of accessing quality education. Further evidence of the large disparities between the socio economic status of girls and women in Mozambique, is found in the gaps in literacy rates between women and women. According to information from the CIDA website (accessed September 12, 2005), Mozambique has a literacy rate of 42%, with 60% of the male population considered literate, whereas 28% of the female population was considered literate (World Bank and UNDP 2004).

According to Ibraimo (2003), there are a number of NGOs/CSOs working directly with issues of and for the promotion of women's empowerment, with education being a priority area to identified. The "Forum Mulher" is a non-governmental confederation of women activists and NGOs in Mozambique, although because of language barriers, I am unable to provide further details concerning this confederation.

As previously mentioned, an urban bias characterizes "civil society" in the country, both in terms of the representativeness and the activities of non-state groups.

> Frelimo's loss of legitimacy in rural areas was due to the oppressive character of its one-party hierarchy, unpopular villagization programmes and failure to provide improved life opportunities in rural areas due to its urban bias" (Buur and Kyed 2005:8).

In response to the local governance/regulatory vacuum the elimination of "traditional leaders'" authority vis-à-vis the state, created, the central state embarked on a process of establishing "dynamizing groups" whose ostensible objectives were to enhance civic participation in the areas in which they functioned (Buur and Kyed 2005). In the late 70's when these groups were formed, along with villagization initiatives during this same time and into the 80's as the war intensified, that "in a context marked by fear and suspicion, coercion became an ever more important component of mobilization and discipline (Alexander 1997:4; Hanlon 1984) By way of conclusion then, Buur and Kyed (2005) state "…there is a very meager history of state-encouraged open 'consultation' or 'participatory' democratic engagement in rural Mozambique" (6-7).

However, over the past fifteen years Mozambique has moved dramatically away from a state-centered development model, thereby opening up spaces for civil society as well as market liberalization (Pfeiffer 2004). As part of the PARPA, decentralization initiatives aim to devolve administrative and budgeting responsibilities to provincial and district levels across a number of sectors, including education. As noted above, traditional leaders have now been formally recognized and "re-accepted" into the administrative structure of the Mozambican government, with new responsibilities accompanying their "new" status as "community authorities".

Within this new "civil society-friendly" environment, two main groups dominate a) international NGOs and b) Pentecostal-influence churches and other church-based organizations (Pfeiffer 2004). Pfeiffer argues that the international NGO presence has exacerbated social inequality by channeling resources primarily to local and national elites. Furthermore, the fact that church-based organizations are proliferating and thriving in poor communities throughout Mozambique, outside of the aid relationship, suggests a

deepening of the marginalization experienced by vulnerable groups in the market economy.

In the early 90's civil servants saw their wages decrease drastically and in less than a five year time span (1991-1996), the wage of health care workers and teachers were a third of what they had been in 1991 (Hanlon 2004:751). In tandem with the reduction in state spending in the health, education and other civil sectors, international donors and NGOs were hiring "technicians" and "paying them high salaries to work for them instead of the government (Hanlon 2004:751; Donini 1995). The behaviour of donor agencies and international NGOs here is also linked by Hanlon (2004) to the problem of state corruption, in that donors gave money to key civil servants to "steal time" and do outside work rather than the government work they were getting to do (752).

A study by Kruse (2002) for NORAD on civil society in Mozambique, found that "there is no clear separation between the formal and the informal, the rural and the urban, the modern and the traditional, those inside and outside the 'state system'" (Rebello, Thue, Stensrud and Sissel 2002:3). The extremely weak institutional capacity of the state is evidenced by the fact that

Following the death of the chief of the Women's Detachment (Josina Machel, the wife of Mozambique's first president after independence, Samora Machel), the organization became the OMM under new leadership. The important point however, is that the OMM, like its predecessors, was created and sustained by the Party (Frelimo).

3.2. Civil Society Participation in National Planning Documents

According to Ibraimo (2003), the most important national planning documents are: a) the Poverty Reduction Action Plan (PARPA as it is referred to in Mozambique); the Medium Term Fiscal Framework (MTFF); the Economic and Social Plan (PES); the Sector Integrated Programs (SIPs) and the Public Budget (9). The PARPA specifies objectives and sets out strategic programs for implementation in priority sectors for the achievement of poverty reduction targets. The financial implications of these sector programs find expression in the MTFF – a medium terms (5 years) budgeting instrument (Ibraimo 2003:9). Mozambique currently has in place SIPs in the education, health, agricultural and roads/infrastructure sectors. The advantage of SIPs is that these documents present in tandem, the sector priorities and programming as well as their financial implications. Furthermore, Ibraimo (2003) suggests that the SIPs process invites the participation of "civil society and international organizations", however she does not specify beyond dissemination activities, in what capacity such non-governmental groups engage in other ways in the SIPs policy process (10).

And finally, the PES and the Public Budget are both instruments that are used for the purposes of evaluating progress made as per the PARPA/PRSP. While the PES's have usually been developed for use at the national and provincial levels, Ibraimo (2003) notes that some "sub-provincial entities have started to develop this planning tool". According to Ibraimo, these PES's represent a potential entry point for lobbying/advocacy efforts – in the case of this author, she is particularly interested in identifying spaces for civil society participation in the gender budgeting process.

3.3. International Civil Society Organizations

Save the Children is a major international NGO with programs ongoing in Mozambique (Save the Children, accessed October 10, 2005). Details of Save's education program is provided in the section below "Civil Society and Education". However, in addition to this program Save is involved in facilitating economic opportunities through lending and

savings programs, targeting women traders. Additionally, Save operates several health related programs, which involve support for government health extension services in isolated communities, HIV/AIDS programs aimed at mitigating the impact of this deadly disease on orphans and other vulnerable children (OVCs), as well as hunger prevention programs.

Indeed, according to Save's website, it has been a leader in terms of drawing attention to the growing problem of OVCs in the country. Currently, orphans represent 6% of the population (Ibid). In the future, Save plans to continue to strengthen their role in responding to this rapidly unfolding crisis, claiming,

> Communities are appreciative of the support in registering children, advocacy for free school and health care while also providing tangible material assistance such as school materials, housing repair assistance and seeds/seedlings for community care gardens (Ibid).

4. Civil Society and Education

The ESSP development process formally seeks to facilitate civil society participation in conjunction with donor-MINED partnership. The cost of the ESSP has been broken down to ¾ met internally, through financing partnership among the government, NGOs, communities and ¼ met by donor funding (Mario et al. 2002).While Coordinating and Consultative councils have been established and given the responsibility of preparing technical reports, there is not any information on who, or if civil society representatives participate in these.

Mozambique is also a partner country in the Commonwealth Education Fund and the CEF Strategic Plan for 2005-2007 details efforts to promote civil society engagement in EFA processes through this initiative. The PARPA 2001 identifies four main problems in the education sector: i) limited educational access; ii) poor quality of teaching and learning; iii) high rate of inefficiency as evident in the high drop-out and repetition rates and; iv) high cost of expanding access and maintaining quality of education (i.e., sustainability concerns) (CEF 2005).

The main international partners in the CEF initiative are Action Aid Mozambique, Save the Children – UK and Oxfam UK. Action Aid Mozambique is the lead agency. The Mozambican Movement on EFA (MEFA) was consulted by the CEF coalition to identify

While the participation of civil society and NGOs (again, these are separated in the official document) in education sector policy and programming consultations is emphasized, the PARPA also indicates the implementation role of "civil society, religious institutions and NGOs" in the areas of adult literacy and adult education.

According to the PARPA most sectors do not have "standardized and permanent" consultation models. However as part of the PARPA process, sectoral consultations were convened, bringing together civil society, NGOs, donors, trade unions, religious bodies and the private sector with the aim of creating "consensus on objectives, priorities, specific targets and sectoral

> Notwithstanding the *modus operandi* of sectoral planning, involving these different hierarchical levels, there is frequent participation by non-governmental entities and organizations, as well as donors and the private sector, which contribute to the various stages of development of the Plan (PARP 2001 Annex: ii).

Basically, at the central level, provincial sectoral plans are "brought into line with guidelines established at macro-level for the sector" (PARPA 2001, Annex: ii).

Overall, the PARPA seeks to highlight the institutional spaces that have been created for civil society participation in education sector policy and programming. For example, the main institutional instruments that are used by the government for managing the change in the education sector are meetings with the a) Consultative Council, b) Coordinating Council of the MINED, c) Education Sector's Donors Coordination Meeting (RECORDE), National Meeting with Provincial and District Directors of Education "to which non-governmental bodies are regularly invited" (PARPA 2001, Annex: ii). Additionally, the MINED consults with NGOs and other civil society groups around education policy and programming, for example the Strategic Plan for Education in which NGOs and major international donors to the education sector participated in the development of.

Perhaps it is somewhat surprising then for the PARPA to state, with reference to two main findings that emerged from the consultation process *about* the process, that

> A certain frustration was noted in relation to the frequency of consultation meetings on various issues. As a result, an emphasis was placed on the need to give priority to implementation and the execution of actions by the State (PARPA 2001:102).

In Mozambique, Save the Children works with communities, local authorities and NGOs/CSOs around the promotion of girls' education and specifically to address the high drop-out rates of girls through targeting the root causes for early school leaving. Save's education program involves the development of school councils, teacher training, school construction, health and nutrition and curriculum development (Ibid).

4.2. Teachers' Unions

Very little information was found concerning teachers' unions vis-à-vis education governance in Mozambique. We do know there is the Organização Nacional de

attitudes such training fosters, may make valuable contributions to opening up spaces for

References

Barnes, S. (1998). NGOs in peace-keeping operations: their role in Mozambique. *Development in Practice, 8*(3), 309-322.

Baylies, C., & Bujra, J. (2000). Special issue on AIDS. *Review of African Political Economy, 27*(86), 483-582.

Bell, E. (2003). Gender and PRSPs: With experiences from Tanzania, Bolivia, Vietnam and Mozambique [Electronic version] [Electronic Version]. *BRIDGE*, 67. Retrieved June 30, 2005 from http://www.ids.ac.uk/bridge/reports/re67.pdf.

Bertelsen, B. E. (2003). The traditional lion is dead: The ambivalent presence of tradition and the relation between politics and violence in Mozambique. *Lusotopie*, 263-264.

Bingen, J., Serrano, A., & Howard, J. (2003). Linking farmers to markets: different approaches to human capital development. *Food Policy, 28*(4), 405-419.

Booth, D., Bierschenk, T., Thioron, E., Bako-Arifari, N., Hanmer, L., Ikiara, G., et al. (2003). Are PRSPs making a difference? The African experience. *Development policy review, 21*(2), 131-287.

Bornstein, L. (2000). Politics and district development planning in Mozambique. *Journal of Contemporary African Studies, 18*(2), 243-264.

Braathen, E. (2003). *Democratic decentralisation in Mozambique? [electronic version].* Paper presented at the Background paper for LPD workshop "Local Politics and Development - Focus on Mozambique, Oslo.

Buchert, L. (2002). Towards new partnerships in sector-wide approaches: Comparative experiences from Burkina Faso, Ghana and Mozambique. *International Journal of Educational Development, 22*, 69-84.

Buston, O. (2003). *Education for All: Fast Track or slow trickle?* Retrieved 20 June, 2004, from http://www.oxfam.org.uk/what-we-do/issues/education/downloads/gce-noprogress.pdf

Buur, L., & Kyed, H. M. (2005). *State recognition of traditional authority in Mozambique: The nexus of community representation and state assistance* (No. Discussion paper 28). Goteborg, Sweden: Nordista Afrikainstitutet.

Carbone, G. M. (2003). Emerging pluralist politics in Mozambique: The Frelimo-Renamo party system. *Working Paper no.23* Retrieved January 4, 2006

Carbone, G. M. (2005). Continuidade na renovacao? Ten years of multiparty politics in Mozambique: Roots, evolution and stabilisation of the Frelimo-Renamo party system. *Journal of Modern African Studies, 43*(3), 417-442.

CIDA (Canadian International Development Agency). (2004). Canada and Mozambique in partnership for development cooperation. *Country Development Programming Framework* Retrieved June 10, 2005

CIDA. http://www.acdi-cida.gc.ca/cidaweb/webcountry.nsf/VLUDocEn/Mozambique-Programmin.8(i)3.ca/cidozMe10.opmdee0,

2   0   0   5

Falck, H., Landfald, K. r., with the assistance of, & Rebelo, P. (2001). *PRSP institutionalization study: Final report, Chapter 7: The PRSP process in Mozambique*. Maputo, Mozambique: Norad. Sida.

Foster, J. (2005). *Canadian development aid review 2005: Statistical annex*. Retrieved November 12, 2005 from http://www.nsi-ins.ca/english/publications/cdr/2005/default.asp

Gerster, R., & Harding, A. (2004). *Baseline survey on program aid partners performance in 2003*: Department for International Development (Dfid).

Gruffydd Jones, B. (2005). Globalisations, violences and resistences in Mozambique: The struggles continue. In C. Eschle & B. Maiguashca (Eds.), *Critical theories, international relations and 'the anti-globalization movement': The politics of global resistence* (pp. 53-73). London/New York: Routledge.

Han, S. K. (1994). Building a peace that lasts: the United Nations and post-civil war peace-building. *New York University Journal of International Law and Politics, 26*(4), 837-892.

Handa, S., Simler, K. R., & Harrower, S. (2004). *Human capital, household welfare and children's schooling in Mozambique*. Washington, DC: International Food Policy Research Institute.

Hanlon, J. (1984). *Mozambique: The revolution under fire*. London: Zed Press.

Hanlon, J. (1991). *Mozambique: Who calls the shots?* Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press.

Hanlon, J. (2004a). Do donors promote corruption?: The case of Mozambique. *Third World Quarterly, 25*(4), 747-763.

Hanlon, J. (2004b). Is it possible to just give money to the poor? *Development and Change, 35*(2), 375-383.

Harber, C. (2005). Reflections on the new conservativisms. *Educational Review, 57*(3), 295-297.

Howell, J. (no year). Manufacturing civil society from the outside: Some dilemmas and challenges. Retrieved January 5, 2006, from http://www.ids.ac.uk/ids/govern/pdfs/jh.pdf

Ibraimo, M. A. (2003). *The gender dimension of Mozambique's budget - an assessment report*. Maputo: UNIFEM - Southern African Regional Office.

Ikdahl, I., Hellum, A., Kaarhus, R., Benjaminsen, T. A., & Kameri-Mbote, K. (2005). Human rights, formalisation and women's land rights in southern and eastern Africa. *Studies in women's law, no.57* Retrieved January 6, 2006, from http://www.oxfam.org.uk/what_we_do/issues/livelihoods/landrights/downloads/womens_land_rights_in_southern_and_eastern_africa.pdf

Jenkins, P. (1999). The role of civil society in the development of housing policy: Some lessons from southern Africa.

Killick, T., Castel-Branco, C., N., & Gerster, R. (2005). *Perfect partners? The performance of programme aid partners in Mozambique, 2004*. UK: Department for International Development (Dfid).

Kruse, S. (2002). *Swaps and civil society:*

World Bank. Retrieved on January 4, 2006 from
http://devdata.worldbank.org/external/CPProfile.asp?CCODE=MOZ&PTYPE=CP

World Bank. (1999). *Project appraisal document on a proposed credit in the amount of 51.1 million SDR (US$ 71 million equivalent) to the Republic of Mozambique for an Education Sector Strategic*

Program (ESSP) (No. 18681-MOZ). Washington, DC: World Bank.

World Bank. (2003). Cost and financing of education: Opportunities and obstacles for expanding and improving education in Mozambique.